

Development of a comparative *fiqh* supplement based on the 4D method to enhance understanding and tolerance attitudes

Saiful Hidayat*, Ahmad Sastra, Abdul Hayyie Al Kattani

Universitas Ibn Khaldun Bogor, Indonesia

*ibadillahdepok@gmail.com

Abstract

This study aims to develop a comparative Fiqh learning supplement for senior high school students as a solution to broaden their understanding of differing views among the four major Islamic schools of thought: Hanafi, Maliki, Shafi'i, and Hanbali. The research uses a Research and Development (R&D) method with the 4D model (Define, Design, Develop, Disseminate). The Define stage involves analyzing student needs and curriculum; Design focuses on creating the supplement according to learning standards; Develop tests the product feasibility through expert validation and limited trials; Disseminate is conducted on a limited scale. Validation results from experts indicate the supplement is highly feasible, with an average score of 84.6. Limited trials with senior high school students show very positive responses in terms of readability, attractiveness, and ease of understanding. This supplement is expected not only to enhance students' comparative fiqh knowledge across madhhabs but also to foster tolerance, critical thinking skills, and maturity in addressing differences in Islamic law. Further research is recommended to test the product's effectiveness on a larger scale and to develop more interactive learning media.

Keywords: Comparative Fiqh; Islamic Madhhabs; 4D Method; Islamic Religious Education; Learning Supplement.

Abstrak

Penelitian ini bertujuan mengembangkan suplemen pembelajaran Fiqih Perbandingan untuk peserta didik Sekolah Menengah Atas sebagai solusi untuk memperluas wawasan terhadap perbedaan pandangan dalam empat madzhab utama Islam yaitu Hanafi, Maliki, Syafii, dan Hanbali. Metode penelitian yang digunakan adalah Research and Development (R&D) dengan model 4D (Define, Design, Develop, Disseminate). Tahap Define dilakukan dengan analisis kebutuhan peserta didik dan kurikulum; Design merancang suplemen sesuai standar pembelajaran; Develop menguji kelayakan produk melalui validasi ahli dan uji coba terbatas; Disseminate dilakukan dalam lingkup terbatas. Hasil validasi ahli menunjukkan bahwa produk suplemen sangat layak digunakan dengan skor rata-rata 84,6. Uji coba terbatas pada peserta didik SMA menunjukkan respons yang sangat positif, dan produk ini diharapkan dapat meningkatkan pemahaman komparatif fiqih madzhab, menumbuhkan sikap

Article Information: Received Nov 11, 2025, Accepted Mar 28, 2026, Published Apr 30, 2026

Copyright (c) 2026 Tawazun: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam

This article is licensed under Creative Commons License **CC-BY-SA**

toleran, berpikir kritis, dan kedewasaan dalam menyikapi perbedaan. Penelitian ini merekomendasikan uji efektivitas produk secara lebih luas dan pengembangan media pembelajaran interaktif.

Kata kunci: Fiqih Perbandingan; Madzhab Islam; Metode 4D; Pendidikan Agama Islam; Suplemen Pembelajaran.

Introduction

Islamic religious education at the high school level is an important pillar in shaping the character, morals, and critical thinking of the young generation of Muslims in Indonesia. The subject of *Fiqh* serves to provide an understanding of Islamic law that regulates various aspects of life, ranging from worship to social *muamalah* (Al-Zuhaili; 2006). However, the majority of high school curricula in Indonesia emphasize one dominant madhhab, especially Shafi'i, so that the diversity of Islamic legal views from the four main madhhabs (Hanafi, Maliki, Shafi'i, Hanbali) is poorly accommodated. The lack of comparative *fiqh* teaching materials causes students to tend to have narrow views, are not open to plurality of opinions and lack tolerance between madhhabs (al-Buti; 2016)

Literature review (state of the art) shows that in the last decade; research related to comparative *fiqh* teaching materials has been growing. Ahmad Fadhil (2017) researched the development of comparative *fiqh* textbooks for high school and found an increase in students' understanding and tolerance. Siti Rahmawati (2018) proves that comparative *fiqh* education is effective as a means of forming a moderate attitude and activating critical discussions. The study of Rini Maulida (2020) and Zainal Abidin (2021) strengthens the results that the integration of comparative *fiqh* material in high school learning increases the insight into Islamic law pluralism and builds the inclusive character of students. The report by Fitri Amelia (2022) and Laila Rahman (2023) analyzes strategies, media, and teachers' constraints in implementing comparative *fiqh* learning, as well as the urgency of integrating practical and innovative media.

Gap analysis shows that the majority of previous research focused on adding comparative *fiqh* material or curriculum development, but not many have designed products based on systematic models, expertly validated, and contextually designed according to the needs of high school students in the digital era. Innovative products that combine print and digital media, character rubrics, case studies, and technology integration are still rare in formal *fiqh* learning practices. On the other hand, high schools in Indonesia have not systematically adopted a multi-*madzhab* approach to instill a tolerant attitude and empirically measurable critical thinking skills.

This research offers novelty statements in the form of development and validation of comparative *fiqh* supplements based on 4D models (Define, Design, Develop, Disseminate) with the integration of comparative materials of the four main *madzhabs*, character rubrics, case studies, reflections, digital media barcodes, as well as empirical evaluation of expert validation and direct tests of students. The resulting product is not just additional material, but as a contextual learning medium that has proven to be feasible and effective in building an understanding of Islamic law pluralism and moderate attitudes.

This research is very important because: (1) the need for valid, practical, and relevant comparative *fiqh* teaching materials is very urgent for both teachers and high school students; (2) multi-madhab *fiqh* education is able to build the foundation of a moderate-religious character and prevent sectarian exclusivism; (3) The supplement model developed is expected to be able to provide real solutions to the problem of limited curriculum and *fiqh* teaching materials in schools.

The main objectives of this article are explicitly to: (1) develop a comparative *fiqh* supplement based on a 4D model that is expertly validated and tested on high school students; (2) analyze the impact of supplement development on improving students' understanding, tolerance, and critical thinking ability in understanding the plurality of Islamic law; (3) provide a model for the implementation of comparative *fiqh* supplement innovations in high schools based on empirical practices and oriented today.

The scientific benefits of this paper include; (1) to make a theoretical contribution to the development of comparative *fiqh* teaching materials based on the 4D model in Islamic religious education; (2) adding references and alternatives to PAI learning innovation models that are adaptive to the needs of the times, while strengthening the literature on religious moderation education in Indonesia; (3) to become a reference for innovation practices for teachers, schools, and policy makers in the implementation of contextual and responsive *fiqh* learning.

It is hoped that this research will allow the supplements developed to be adapted by Islamic schools in Indonesia, become a national reference for the *fiqh* curriculum, improve the quality of learning and character education in an inclusive manner and encourage religious moderation among students.

Research Methods

This research uses the Research and Development (R&D) method with a 4D model consisting of Define, Design, Develop, and Disseminate (Waruwu, 2024). The following is presented a detailed matrix table of research procedures.

Table 1. The 4D Development Model

Research Stage	Main Activities	Methods/Instruments	Purpose/Output
Define	Analysis of student needs and curriculum	Observations, interviews, literature studies	Identification of the need for the development of comparative <i>fiqh</i> supplements in high school
Design	Designing the product design of the supplement module	Preparation of content plans, module formats	Initial product draft based on needs analysis
Develop	Product validation by material, language, media experts	Validation questionnaire, discussion and expert input	Product revision and refinement based on validation results
	Trial limited to students	Student Response Questionnaire, Observation	Initial response and effectiveness data from real users
Disseminate	Socialization and dissemination of limited products	Distribution of modules to schools, collection of feedback	The final product is ready for use, feedback for further development

This matrix briefly describes the stages, activities, methods, and research outputs that are coherent and transparent in accordance with the reporting rules of scientific journals of development research. This approach prioritizes a systematic process to ensure product validity and relevance of learning applications.

Results and Discussion

This research produced a comparative *fiqh* learning module supplement product that is valid and very feasible to use based on validation and limited trials on students of SMA Budi Cendekia Islamic School Depok. The supplement is designed with a holistic and systematic approach that divides the material into six comprehensive units, using a consistent table format and narratives relevant to the character of high school learners. This approach is in line with Piaget and Vygotsky's constructivist learning theories that emphasize the importance of contextual and real activity-based learning to internalize values and concepts (Santrock, 2017).

Validation by material, language, and media experts showed an average percentage score of 84.6%, in the very feasible category. Experts assessed that the supplement material was accurate, the language used was according to the level of development of students, and learning media was interesting and easy to use.

This supports the theory of evaluation of learning products that prioritize aspects of content validity and applicability (Gall, Gall & Borg, 2007).



Figure 1. Cover of the Comparative *Fiqh* Supplement

Qualitative data from experts and students provide evidence that this comparative *fiqh* supplement is able to bridge the gap between curriculum and learning practices that have been focused on one *madzhab*, especially Shafi'i. This module provides an opportunity for students to develop a moderate-religious character that respects the difference of opinion of the madhhab, in accordance with the concept of moderation in Islamic education (Az-Zuhaili, 2006).

In addition, the preparation of modules involving reflection and case studies strengthens critical and tolerant learning, in accordance with Bell & Stevenson's (2006) theory of critical and transformational learning in schools. Given the limitations of the trial in one school with limited participants, the researchers suggested a broader test that also examined the impact of the product on changes in the character of religious moderation, critical thinking ability, and tolerance between schools. The research data is processed and presented in the form of a clear and easy-to-understand table. One of the main tables is a recapitulation table of the results of the validation assessment by experts and student responses that show the level of product feasibility.

Table 2. Expert Validation Results

Aspects	Average Score (%)	Categories
Subject Matter Expert Validation	94.2	Highly Worth It
Linguist Validation	79.2	Highly Worth It
Media Expert Validation	80.4	Highly Worth It
Average	84.6	Highly Worth It

In addition, the results of the limited trial showed positive responses from students in the aspects of material content, interest, attitude development, and learning benefits with an average score of more than 90% in the strongly agree category. Students' qualitative feedback also supports the readability and suitability of the material, as well as providing development suggestions such as the addition of images and inspirational stories. The analysis shows that the development of this comparative *fiqh* supplement has succeeded in meeting the real needs of high school students who have not previously received *fiqh* teaching materials with a multi-*madzhab* approach. The validation results are very feasible according to the criteria of Gall, Gall & Borg (2007) regarding the validity of learning products that must meet the aspects of material, language, and learning media.

The learning approach carried out is in accordance with the constructivist theory of Piaget and Vygotsky (Santrock, 2017) and the theory of learning motivation of Deci & Ryan (1985) which emphasizes active interaction and material relevance for students so as to motivate independent and critical learning. By integrating case studies and reflections, this module helps build an attitude of tolerance and comparative understanding that is important in the context of madhhab diversity. The results of this study are consistent with the findings of Ahmad Fadhil (2017), Siti Rahmawati (2018), and Zainal Abidin (2021) who reveal the main benefits of comparative *fiqh* learning in forming tolerance attitudes and expanding students' religious horizons. However, there are limitations on the scale of the trial that are only in one school and a limited number of participants, which are a consideration for advanced research for testing effectiveness at large.

Conclusion

Based on the results of the research and discussion, it can be concluded that the *Fiqh* learning supplement Comparison for high school students who are developed using the Research and Development (R&D) model with the 4D stage (Define, Design, Develop, Disseminate) have met the eligibility criteria both in terms of materials, language, and learning media. Validation by experts showed an average score of 84.6% in the very feasible category, while the trial was limited

to students receiving a very positive response in terms of readability, interest, ease of understanding, and learning benefits. This supplement is significantly able to broaden students' understanding of the pluralism of Islamic schools and foster tolerance, critical thinking skills, and maturity in responding to differences in Islamic law. The preparation of modules that are equipped with case studies, reflections, and learning instructions supports a more independent and meaningful learning process for students. The limitation of the research lies in the scope of the trial which is still limited to one school with a relatively small sample of students. Therefore, further research is recommended to conduct effectiveness tests on a wider scale as well as the development of more interactive and contextual learning media to increase the absorption and implementation of learning outcomes. Overall, this supplement can be used as an alternative *fiqh* learning media in high school that is relevant to the needs of the curriculum and the character development of students in the era of globalization.

Suggestions and Acknowledgments

It is recommended for teachers to implement Comparative *Fiqh* supplements This is in the learning process as a medium to increase students' comparative understanding and tolerance attitudes effectively. Product developers can develop digital versions or interactive e-modules equipped with audiovisual media to increase the attractiveness and effectiveness of learning. Further research needs to expand trials in more diverse schools and regions to test the effectiveness of supplements in a broader context. Learning methods that involve case studies and group discussions using this supplement are highly recommended to maximize learning outcomes. We appreciate everyone's help until this article is released. It is hoped that this article will make a significant contribution to a better knowledge of humanity and create a forum for a more comprehensive and in-depth perspective on humanity.

Bibliography

- Al-Zuhaili, W. (2006). *Al-Fiqh al-Islami wa Adillatuhu*. Dar al-Fikr.
- Al-Zuhaili, W. (n.d.). *Ushul al-Fiqh al-Islami*. Damaskus: Dar al-Fikr.
- Departemen Pendidikan Nasional. (2003). *Kurikulum Berbasis Kompetensi: Mata Pelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam*.
- Ibnu Rusyd. *Bidayatul Mujtahid*, Takhrij Ahmad Abu Al-Majd. Pustaka Azzam.
- Kirkpatrick, D. L., & Kirkpatrick, J. D. (2006). *Evaluating Training Programs: The Four Levels*. Berrett-Koehler.
- Munawar-Rachman, B. (2001). *Islam Pluralis: Wacana Kesetaraan Kaum Beriman*. Jakarta: Paramadina.
- Musthafa Diip Al-Bugha. (2009). *Fiqh Islam Lengkap Penjelasan Hukum-Hukum Islam*

Madzhab Syafii. Media Ziki.

- Muttaqin, M. R., Fauzan, U., & Malihah, N. (2023). Pengaruh pembelajaran akidah akhlak terhadap akhlakul karimah peserta didik Madrasah Aliyah Miftahul Ulum Anggana. *Tawazun: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 16(2), 363-376. <https://doi.org/10.32832/tawazun.v16i2.14233>
- Nasution, H. (1986). *Islam Ditinjau Dari Berbagai Aspeknya*. Jakarta: UI-Press.
- Prastowo, A. (2015). *Panduan Kreatif Membuat Bahan Ajar Inovatif*. Yogyakarta: Diva Press.
- Qomar, M. (2007). *Pendidikan Islam dan Madrasah Aliyah di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Erlangga.
- Sa'id Ramadhan al-Buti. (2016). *Kubral Yaqin: Comparative Studies on Islamic Jurisprudence*.
- Santrock, J. W. (2017). *Educational Psychology: Theory and Application*. New York: McGraw-Hill Education.
- Sugiyono. (2019). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Sulhan, S. (2022). Pendidikan akhlak perspektif Ibnu Taimiyah: Analisis kitab Tazkiyatun Nafs. *Tawazun: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 15(3), 379-396. <https://doi.org/10.32832/tawazun.v15i3.8588>
- Ubaidah, A. N., & Widyasari. (2024). Pengembangan suplemen bahan ajar akhlak terhadap diri dan sesama manusia untuk Sekolah Dasar. *Tawazun: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 17(3), 613-626. <https://doi.org/10.32832/tawazun.v17i3.17574>
- Waruwu, M. (2024). 4D Research and Development Model: Trends, Challenges, and Opportunities Review. *Jurnal Ilmiah Profesi Pendidikan*, 9(2), 1220-1229. <https://doi.org/10.31599/na7deq07>